

Committee and Date

Cabinet

4th September 2019

<u>Item</u>

(leave blank)

Public

Approval of changes to parking strategy following endorsement by Cabinet Wednesday 3rd July 2019

Responsible Officer: Mark Barrow – mark.barrow@shropshire.gov.uk

Tele: 01743 258919

1.0 Summary

1.1 Part 1 and 2 of the Parking Strategy proposals was approved by Cabinet on 17th January 2018 and 11th April 2018 respectively. 17 of the 22 part 1 recommendations have been implemented, the new on street residents parking policy has been adopted in Ludlow and a detailed feasibility proposal exercise for on street residents parking has been completed in Bridgnorth.

New pay and display parking machines have been installed across the county. All new machines have facilities for cash, card and contactless payments. Digital permits and tickets are also being rolled out through the Mipermit system.

A number of issues have been raised following rollout including concerns with regards to increases in tariffs, the impact on the local economy, concessions for holiday lets and the reduction of on street resident permit provision.

Improvements to the parking service include improved ease of enforcement, improved customer satisfaction and more streamlined service with a large increase in chip and pin, contactless payments and digital ticketing.

The data available in the period following implementation and observations on the ground give evidence of a change in parking habits with an outward migration from on street parking bays to outlying off street carparks. The amendment proposals are intended to further refine the parking service, support ongoing development of Transport Mode Hierarchy and reduce environmental impact in our market towns. Further to endorsement by Cabinet on Wednesday 3rd July 2019 of the recommendations of the Performance Management Scrutiny Committee regarding the six-month review of the Parking Strategy, this report seeks approval to progress with the required stake holder and subsequent formal Traffic Regulation Order consultations to implement the agreed changes to the parking strategy.

2.0 Recommendations

- 2.1 That authority is given to proceed with the required public consultations to enable implementation of the following amendments to the parking strategy.
 - i Changes to the geographical boundaries for qualification for residents on-street permits to the existing Red zone and Blue area residents

parking schemes in Ludlow are assessed and implemented if after full consultation any changes are deemed appropriate.

- ii To introduce concessions that allow, in appropriate circumstances entitlement by residents who hold on-street parking permits to also park within approved specified carparks that are in close proximity to on-street residents parking schemes.
- iii That all loading bays across the county excluding shared use bays should operate 24 hours a day 7 days a week.
- iv That when the number of on-street parking spaces available in any residents parking scheme is less than the number of properties, the on-street residents parking permit criteria restricting allocation to one permit per property, registered in the scheme, be increased to 2 permits per property subject to the completion of a residents survey where 51% or more of the returns indicate a preference and the local Member/s is/are in support.
- v To assist with the excessive demand for season tickets in some popular carparks it is proposed that the specified maximum number of resident permit and season ticket thresholds for all off street carparks are combined to give an overall maximum threshold for each carpark.
- vi That annual permit concessions for holiday let properties located within an on-street residents parking scheme be provided.

 Entitlement to be one digital permit per holiday let property at a cost of £100 per permit which is equivalent to the cost of a residents on street permit.
- vii That the times of operation of the evening /overnight tariffs on Mondays to Saturdays in Raven Meadows multi storey car park, Shrewsbury are brought forward to by 2 hours to apply between the hours of 6.00pm and 8.00am.
- viii That on Mondays to Saturdays in Raven Meadows multi storey car park, Shrewsbury a 2 hour rather than the existing 3-hour tariff cap to the evening /overnight tariffs should apply.
- 2.2 That the Executive Director of Place in consultation with the Portfolio Holder, be given delegated authority to consider the outcomes of the consultation decide whether to implement recommendations i to viii following the public consultation, and to make, publish and confirm any TRO changes required as a result of the implementation of any of the proposed changes to the Strategy.
- 2.3 That the following amendments to the parking strategy are approved and implemented:
 - i That digital tickets (primarily pay by mobile) are added as an additional payment option to the on-street pay and display service.

- ii That Shropshire Council absorb the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments
- 2.4 That the proposal for season tickets to be made available on the Shrewsbury Park and Ride service with an annual season ticket tariff of £200 per annum is considered within the on-going review of the service.

3.0 Opportunities and risks

- 3.1 It is anticipated that the implementation of these recommendations will further enhance the performance of the parking service with potential improvements for both customer and service delivery streamlining, promotion of Transport Mode Hierarchy and hence further address environmental issues.
- 3.2 Recommendations 2.1 (i to viii) will require appropriate stakeholder consultation to be undertaken and then consideration of the outcome of the consultation before deciding whether to proceed to implement those items. Should significant matters arise during the consultation that raise concerns about proceeding with any of the recommendations, the delegation to the Director of Place does not preclude providing a further report to Cabinet. Following a decision about the proposed amendments to the Parking Strategy there would then need to be formal consultation for any necessary revisions to Traffic Regulation Orders (TRO). Given current levels of resource this consultation work will take a minimum of 3 months to complete and a further 3 months lead in for implementation.
- 3.3 Recommendation 2.4 will be incorporated for consideration within the ongoing Park and Ride review and will not be progressed within the parking strategy review.
- 3.4 The Council is currently experiencing difficulties in recruiting additional traffic engineers, the absence of appropriate resource is expected to impact on ongoing parking service development work. This work is of a specialist nature and current in-house expertise has been reassigned to general traffic management duties as part of the new highways structure. Options for the appointment of traffic engineering staff including potential apprenticeship opportunities are currently being explored.

4.0 Financial assessment

4.1 Based on current transaction figures the cost of Shropshire Council absorbing the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments, recommendation 2.3 (ii) is estimated to be around £7,500 per annum. As well as enhancement of the service for customers there are significant savings benefits associated with the purchase of digital tickets. The intention is to further promote digital permit purchase and the number of digital transactions are expected to increase, consequently the number of required journeys for cash collection duties should decrease.

It is anticipated that the proposed additional concessions for evening parking with Raven Meadows multi storey car park, recommendation 2.1 (vii and viii) will attract more customers and assist in retaining day time customers for evening and overnight parking, hence on balance these additional concessions should be cost neutral with existing arrangements.

Other than the above, the financial implications for implementation of all the proposed amendments involve officer resource to undertake the required consultations, TRO noticing costs and administration associated with implementation.

5.0 Background

- 5.1 Part I of the Parking Strategy proposals comprising a total of 22 recommendations including the adoption of standard banding levels and linear pricing was approved by Cabinet at its meeting on 17th January 2018. 17 of the 22 part 1 recommendations have been completed / implemented.
- Part 2 of the parking strategy proposals was approved by Cabinet at its meeting on 11th April 2018. The new on street residents parking policy has been adopted within the existing residents parking schemes in Ludlow. The new policy is yet to be applied to existing schemes in Oswestry and Bridgnorth. A detailed feasibility proposal exercise has been completed in both High and Low Town, Bridgnorth involving local Members and resident groups, residents' questionnaires are now undergoing development. Appropriate consultation with local Members has been maintained throughout the process. Some provisional survey work has been undertaken in Oswestry.
- 5.3 Additional revisions to the Parking Strategy were approved by Cabinet at its meeting on 25th July 2018 and have been implemented, these include:
 - The provision of season ticket concessions for hotel, guest house, bed and breakfast, self-catering or holiday let establishments in specified Shropshire Council car parks.
 - 2. Revocation of the previously approved 50% concessions on Sundays, Bank and Public holidays of the report to Cabinet on 17 January 2018) to the on-street parking at Mereside, Ellesmere.
 - 3. The removal of all existing concessions for market traders with the exception of Ludlow where the existing concessions shall remain.
 - 4. Provision of unlimited periods of parking on Sundays, Bank and Public holidays in Raven Meadows multi storey car park Shrewsbury for the flat rate of £1.50 per day.
 - 5. Reduction in the proposed Band 1 tariff to £2.40 per hour.
 - 6. The revocation from the on-street parking places TRO the part that

relates to the former on street resident voucher scheme in Shrewsbury.

- 7. The removal of the provision of weekly tickets, residents' permits and season tickets in Frankwell Riverside & Quay.
- Further revisions to the Parking Strategy approved by Cabinet at its meeting on 5th September 2018 relating to the Reduction of Charging Hours in Ludlow and Shrewsbury from 8.00pm to 6.00pm have also, all been implemented.

All recommendations and approvals made by Cabinet to date relating to the Parking Strategy together with an itemised report on progress are listed in full within appendix 1 of the report to the Performance Management Scrutiny Committee, Wednesday, 5th June 2019.

- Further to endorsement by Cabinet on Wednesday 3rd July 2019 of the recommendations of the Performance Management Scrutiny Committee regarding the six-month review of the Parking Strategy, this report seeks approval to progress with the required stake holder and subsequent formal Traffic Regulation Order consultations to implement the agreed changes to the parking strategy.
- 6.0 Recommendations for improvements to Parking Service subject to additional consultation.
- Proposed changes to the geographical boundaries for qualification for residents on -street permits to the existing Red zone and Blue area residents parking schemes in Ludlow. Recommendation 2.1 (i)

 Concerns have been raised and requests received for changes in permit qualification from one zone /area to another for certain addresses within the Ludlow schemes. It is considered that a best fit review should be undertaken to include consultation with residents and the local Member. If an amendment to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.
- To introduce concessions that allow, in appropriate circumstances entitlement by residents who hold on-street parking permits to also park within approved specified carparks that are in close proximity to on-street residents parking schemes. Recommendation 2.1 (ii)

 A number of complaints have been received with regards to the increase in tariffs to the Riverside west elevated car park in Bridgnorth. Riverside west elevated carpark is unique in that its use is restricted solely for off street resident permit holders. This issue has been discussed with residents as part of the on-street residents parking review.

An amendment to the strategy is recommended that will allow residents who hold on-street parking permits to also park within suitable carparks that are in the vicinity of on-street residents parking schemes without having to purchase an additional off-street permit. Note, it is not proposed that this additional concession will be applied to any Shropshire Council car parks that currently have pay and display facilities. Rather as the review of onstreet residents parking schemes progresses it is anticipated that some

carparks that are currently free and without restriction, could be restricted so as to be made available as overflow parking for on-street resident permit holders when on street parking is limited. For example, Riverside west elevated car park, Bridgnorth which is not a pay and display but a residents only off street car park is adjacent to the Friar Street / Cartway on-street residents parking scheme.

If an amendment to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.

- That all loading bays across the county excluding shared use bays should operate 24 hours a day 7 days a week. Recommendation 2.1 (iii)

 It is considered that provision for loading should always be available and that there is a need for consistency across the county in order to avoid confusion. It is therefore recommended that all loading bays within the highway across the county operate 24 hours a day,7 days a week. If an amendment to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.
- That when the number of on-street parking spaces available in any residents parking scheme is less than the number of properties, the on-street residents parking permit criteria restricting allocation to one permit per property, registered in the scheme, be increased to 2 permits per property subject to the completion of a residents survey where 51% or more of the returns indicate a preference and the local Member/s is/are in support.

 Recommendation 2.1 (iv)

During the review of residents parking schemes in Bridgnorth, it has become apparent that the new policy will only provide 1 permit rather than 2 in most existing and proposed schemes, this reduction is of primary concern to residents.

Some residents have highlighted that not everyone within a scheme requires a permit therefore there is potential for relaxation of the policy. However, from an operational perspective it is important to ensure that when a charge is being made for the provision of a concession, in this case provision of an on-street parking space for residents in proximity to their homes, that although not guaranteed all of the time, a space should be available most of the time. Consideration also needs to be given to other highway users, vehicular access, other parking requirements for shoppers and visitors, as well as blue badge holders and access for deliveries etc.

The recommendation is that public consultation be undertaken with a view to amendment to the strategy enabling the reinstatement of 2 permits per property. Part 2 of the parking strategy could be amended as follows: 'When the number of on-street parking spaces available in any proposed residents parking scheme is less than the number of properties registered in the scheme, resident permit allocation should normally be limited to a maximum of one per property. However, subject to the completion of a resident's survey, where 51% or more of the returns indicate a preference and the local Member/s is/are in support, the allocation of 2 permits per residential property can be permitted.

If an amendment to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.

6.5 To assist with the excessive demand for season tickets in some popular carparks it is proposed that the specified maximum number of resident permit and season ticket thresholds for all off street carparks are combined to give an overall maximum threshold for each carpark. Recommendation 2.1 (v)

There are 4 car parks were season ticket issue has exceeded 90% of the maximum allocations determined by the current strategy and specified in the TRO.

- 1. Innage Lane, Bridgnorth
- 2. Galdeford Zone B (Upper), Ludlow
- 3. Frankwell, Shrewsbury
- 4. Abbey Foregate, Shrewsbury

It is recommended that consideration be given to amendment of the strategy and TRO consultation be undertaken to combine the maximum number of resident permit and season ticket thresholds in to one.

For example, in Frankwell carpark the maximum number of Residents Permits currently specified is 135 and the maximum number of Season Tickets currently specified is 68. The new maximum threshold for combined issue would therefore be 203. If an amendment to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.

The high usage of Frankwell and Abbey Foregate car parks in general is now of concern, one way of addressing this is to give consideration for season tickets to be made available on the Shrewsbury Park and Ride service with an annual season ticket tariff of £200 per annum, as recommendation 2.4, subject to consultation.

That annual permit concessions for holiday let properties located within an on-street residents parking scheme be provided. Entitlement to be one digital permit per holiday let property at a cost of £100 per permit which is equivalent to the cost of a residents on street permit. Recommendation 2.1 (vi)

A collective of proprietors of tourist accommodation in Ludlow are requesting reinstatement of concessions to enable guests to be able to park near their accommodation within the Ludlow shared use pay and display/ residents parking bays.

It is recommended that consideration be given to an amendment of the strategy to allow the issue of annual permits at a cost equivalent to that of a resident's on street permit, £100.Entitlement would be 1 permit per property that is registered as a holiday let within any on-street residents parking scheme. Holiday let permits will not include the 200-hour visitor parking allocation that is included with a resident's permit.

If an amendment to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.

6.7 That the times of operation of the evening /overnight tariffs on Mondays to Saturdays in Raven Meadows multi storey car park, Shrewsbury are brought forward to by 2 hours to apply between the hours of 6.00pm and 8.00am. Recommendation 2.1 (vii)

And

That on Mondays to Saturdays in Raven Meadows multi storey car park,
Shrewsbury a 2 hour rather than the existing 3-hour tariff cap to the evening
/overnight tariffs should apply. Recommendation 2.1 (viii)

The opening hours in Raven Meadows multi storey car park have been extended to 7am to midnight Monday to Saturday and 9am to 10pm on Sundays and Bank/Public Holidays. The charging hours in Raven Meadows multi storey car park have been extended to 24 hours a day, 7 days a week with a 3-hour cap on the parking periods between the hours of 8pm to 8am. Unlimited periods of parking on Sundays, Bank and Public holidays in Raven Meadows multi storey car park Shrewsbury have been also been introduced for a flat rate of £1.50. Raven Meadows is a band 2 car park, tariff £1.80 per hour.

The decision to retain free parking within all pay and display parking areas in Shrewsbury from 6.00pm rather than 8.00pm was made as a revision to the original strategy, without adjustment to the Raven Meadows multi storey car park proposals. This combined with the 3-hour cap on parking from 8.00pm is resulting in:

- Customers using the alternative on-street and off-street car parks rather than Raven Meadows multi storey car park in the evenings and overnight;
- ii. Customers not using Raven Meadows multi storey car park because of the tariff.
- iii. Customers deciding to exit Raven Meadows multi storey car park at 6.00pm and use the Premier Inn pay and display car park which provides a 24-hour parking period for £8.
- iv. Customers who use Raven Meadows multi storey car park for a period prior to 8.00pm having to pay a cumulative linear tariff for their period of stay up until 8.00pm and then if their stay goes beyond 8.00pm having to continue to pay the linear tariffs for up to a further 3 hours (until 11.00pm), after which the 3-hour cap applies.

If amendments to the strategy is approved formal TRO consultation and approval will also be required prior to implementation.

7.0 Recommendations for improvements to Parking Service not subject to additional consultations

7.1 <u>Provision of digital tickets for On-street Pay and Display Recommendation</u> 2.3 (i)

The rollout and availability of digital tickets in general has been well received and requests for this service to be provided for on-street pay and display have been received. This was omitted from the original proposals, at the

time there were some operational issues and some concern that this provision may result in some customers occupying premium locations for long periods, low turnover and denying access for other users such as blue badge holders, this has not materialised.

The recommendation that digital tickets (primarily pay by mobile) are added as an additional payment option for our on-street pay and display service can be undertaken fairly quickly if approved.

7.2 <u>Shropshire Council to absorb the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments</u> Recommendation 2.3 (ii)

Digital payments are now being purchased either online or pay by phone using Mipermit. Mipermit enables car park operators to accept electronic payments for Pay & Display car parking, residents and visitor permits, and season tickets. Each electronic permit is digital, no ticket is displayed in the vehicle. For each pay and display ticket transaction Mipermit charge a convenience fee of £0.10, the convenience fee is added to the cost of the parking purchased and currently charged directly to the customer.

As the strategy roll out / go live has established the number of Mipermit transactions have increased. Digital transactions are also proving more popular as awareness of the service develops and anxiety issues are overcome, more customers are registering for the service.

Digital payments using Mipermit rather than payments through the machines have the advantage of providing real time data, there are also advantages to the customer, they can pre-book or top up remotely, digital payments promote dwell time.

The number of cash transactions through pay and display machines has already reduced with the provision of chip and pin, card and contactless payment options. Cash collection from parking machines across the county is managed centrally by parking Services staff based at Shirehall. The technology within the new machines now gives the ability for parking services to monitor the accumulation of coinage within a machine, this technology has improved the day to day management of the cash collection service, cash collection operations are now better managed in accordance with known fluctuations in usage. The total number of visits to parking machines for cash collections during April 2018 was 683, this reduced to 563 during April 2019. To limit risk there are limits on the quantity of cash that can be carried in vehicles at any one time and as such multiple trips are often taken across the county.

It is considered inappropriate that customers wishing to purchase digital tickets are having to pay more for the service than those customers purchasing tickets at the machine. Given the monetary savings associated with digital payments, service efficiencies and carbon foot print savings it is recommended that consideration be given to Shropshire Council absorbing the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments. A target of 500 cash collection visits or less per calendar month is envisaged.

The recommendation that Shropshire Council absorb the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments can be undertaken almost immediately if

approved.

8.0 Conclusions

8.1 Any changes to the geographical boundaries for qualification for residents on -street permits to the existing Red zone and Blue area residents parking schemes in Ludlow will improve convenience of the service for residents.

Concessions that allow, in appropriate circumstances entitlement by residents who hold on-street parking permits to also park within approved specified carparks that are in close proximity to on-street residents parking schemes will improve the service for residents and promote transport hierarchy.

The operation of all loading bays across the county excluding shared use bays 24 hours a day 7 days a week will improve service provision.

The increase in availability of 2 permits per property for on-street parking spaces available in any residents parking scheme, will improve the service for residents.

The combination of the specified maximum number of resident permit and season ticket thresholds for all off street carparks to give an overall maximum threshold for each carpark will better facilitate demand and hence promote transport hierarchy.

The provision of season tickets on the Shrewsbury Park and Ride service will provide concessionary rates for commuters, hence freeing up availability in town centre car parks for visitors and promoting transport hierarchy.

The provision of annual permit concessions for holiday let properties located within an on street residents parking schemes will address access issues for quests and hence promote the local tourism economy.

The addition of digital tickets (primarily pay by mobile) as an additional payment option to the on-street pay and display service will provide parity with the off-street car park service and enhance service provision.

The cost of Shropshire Council absorbing the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments is estimated to be around £7,500 per annum. As well as enhancement of the service for customers there are significant savings benefits associated with the purchase of digital tickets.

It is considered that the proposed adjustments to times of operation and tariffs in Raven Meadows multi storey car park will be more attractive to customers, promote increase in use and hence enhance transport hierarchy.

8.2 The Council is currently experiencing extreme difficulties in recruiting additional traffic engineers, the absence of appropriate resource is expected to impact on on-going parking service development work.

- 8.3 The recommended amendments are intended to further streamline service delivery, enhance customer satisfaction, the local economy, ongoing development of the Transport Mode Hierarchy and address environmental issues.
- To avoid the need to return to Cabinet delegated authority for the Executive Director of Place is requested to consider the outcomes of the consultation and decided whether to implement recommendations i to viii, and to make, publish and confirm any TRO changes required as a result of the implementation of any of the proposed changes to the Strategy. Authority is also requested to implement those recommendations that do not require further consultation.

9.0 Programme for implementation of proposed parking strategy amendments

Proposal	Drogrammo
Proposal Recommendation 2.1	Programme Public Consultation
i Changes to the geographical	September 2019 –
boundaries for qualification for residents on -	November 2019
street permits to the existing Red zone and	TD0 0 " "
Blue area residents parking schemes in	TRO Consultation
Ludlow	January 2020 – March
ii To introduce concessions that allow to	2020
also park within approved specified carparks	
that are in close proximity to on-street	Implementation from:
residents parking schemes.	April 2020
iii All loading bays across the county	
excluding shared use bays should operate 24	
hours a day 7 days a week.	
iv Increased allocation to 2 permits per	
property.	
v Combination of specified maximum	
number of resident permit and season ticket	
thresholds for all off street carparks.	
vi Annual permit concessions for holiday	
let properties located within an on street	
residents parking scheme	
vii Times of operation of the evening	
/overnight tariffs on Mondays to Saturdays in	
Raven Meadows multi storey car park,	
Shrewsbury are brought forward to by 2 hours	
to apply between the hours of 6.00pm and	
8.00am.	
viii A 2 hour rather than the existing 3 hour	
tariff cap to the evening /overnight tariffs on	
Mondays to Saturdays in Raven Meadows	
multi storey car.	
Recommendation 2.3	Implementation with
i That digital tickets (primarily pay by	appropriate promotions
mobile) are added as an additional	from September 2019.
payment option to the on-street pay and	

display service.

ii That Shropshire Council absorb the convenience fee on all digital ticket payments

Note: Should significant matters arise during the consultation that raise concerns about proceeding with any of the recommendations, the delegation to the Director of Place does not preclude providing a further report to Cabinet The programme for implementation of any such recommendations may alter should that be the case.

List of Background Papers (This MUST be completed for all reports, but does not include items containing exempt or confidential information)

- Shropshire Parking Review (Initial scoping review) May 2014
- Report on Shropshire Parking Strategy Mouchel January 2015
- Shropshire Parking Proposal Executive Summary Mouchel January 2015
- Shropshire Parking Implementation Plan (Phase 1) Mouchel- November 2015
- Shropshire Draft Parking Strategy Cabinet Report 12 July 2017
 http://shropshire.gov.uk/committee-services/documents/g3418/Public%20reports%20pack%2012th-Jul-s2017%2012.30%20Cabinet.pdf?T=10
- Current Shropshire Parking Strategy Appendix A4 Parking Charge Structure. https://shropshire.gov.uk/media/1360/parking-strategy-Appendix-a4-parking-charge-structure.pdf
- New Parking Strategy Framework Part 1 Implementation of the Linear Model 17th January 2018 Cabinet report http://shropshire.gov.uk/committee-services/documents/b12014/Cabinet%20To%20Follow%201%2017th-Jan-2018%2012.30%20Cabinet.pdf?T=9
- New Parking Strategy Framework Traffic Regulation Order (TRO) decision report: Ludlow and Shrewsbury - Changes to On-Street Pay and Display and Loading, Cabinet report 25 July 2018.
- New Parking Strategy Framework Traffic Regulation Order (TRO) decision report:
- Reports to Cabinet 5th September 2018
 http://shropshire.gov.uk/committee-services/ieListDocuments.aspx?Cld=130&Mld=3845&Ver=4
- Changes to off street parking places around the county, Cabinet report 25 July 2018.
- Parking Strategy Framework Proposed Revisions Reduction of Charging Hours in Ludlow and Shrewsbury
- New Parking Strategy Framework Traffic Regulation Order Changes to On Street Parking Places in Shrewsbury
- New Parking Strategy Framework Traffic Regulation Order Changes to Off Street
- Parking Places Shrewsbury

- Report to Cabinet 3rd July 2019Parking strategy implementation six-month review

Cabinet Member (Portfolio Holder)

Councillor Steve Davenport

Appendices